

MEDA

Pathways

# CRAFTING CONNECTIONS

THE IMPACT OF MARKET LINKAGES ON ENTREPRENEURSHIP, HOUSEHOLD INCOME  
& ECONOMIC CONTRIBUTION OF FEMALE MICRO-ENTREPRENEURS

A REVIEW OF ALUMNI MICRO-ENTREPRENEURS OF PATHWAYS & PURSESTRINGS PROJECT  
(2008-2012)

By Monitoring & Evaluation Department



**Kaarvan Crafts Foundation**  
*Crafting Livelihoods*

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) department at Kaarvan Crafts Foundation (KCF) ran a second round of its project, 'Crafting Connections,' to engage, this time, with its alumni female Micro-Entrepreneurs (MEs) from the 'Pathways & Pursestrings (PnP) Project' through in-depth phone call interviews. The aim of the project was to connect with our alumni and derive basic & economic information of the Micro-Entrepreneurs who were trained in life skills and linked with markets under the PnP project. In-depth interviews were also conducted by the Marketing & Communication (MnC) department to capture success stories of MEs.

The M&E department of MEDA (partner organization) carried out an impact evaluation study in 2012-2013 which was primarily centered on Women Embellishers (WEs), changes in their incomes and their standings in domestic, social and political spaces. (Brief results of the MEDA report are shared in Appendix A.) The M&E department at Kaarvan Crafts Foundation (KCF) directed the 'Crafting Connections' project to evaluate the economic benefits to the MEs after three years of completion of the PnP program. The variables of interest were: **Number of women currently running a business; Number of workers employed by the MEs, Monthly Income earned by MEs; Household Income earned by MEs; Proportion of income earned by MEs in her household.**

213 MEs were connected to a member of the staff directly linked with the PnP project. The **responsiveness rate was 39%** hence the sample data was that of **82 respondents**. Out of 82 respondents, 55 MEs currently report running a business which depicts that **67% of the respondents are currently running a business**. The MEs employ **53 workers on average** who form the indirect beneficiaries of the arrangement. It was found that an **ME is earning around Rs. 23,427 (GBP 157) on average**, while the **average household income of an ME is around Rs. 42,947 (GBP 289)**. The economic contribution of MEs in their household was measured by the proportion of her income in that of her household's. The **economic contribution of female MEs in her household is 52%**.

## PATHWAYS & PURSESTRINGS (PNP) PROJECT- A BRIEF OVERVIEW

The PnP project, in collaboration with Mennonite Economic Development Association (MEDA) was initiated in 2008 and concluded in 2012 with the goal of increasing the income of low-income homebound Women Embellishers (WEs) across Pakistan. The working model was such that **8,184** WEs were mobilized along with **213** Female Sales Agents (also referred as MEs). The WEs and MEs were trained in various life skills with a weighted focus on development of their business capabilities. The list of trainings provided to MEs and WEs is in Appendix B. The MEs, working as Sales Agents, were connected with buying houses which ensured a supply of sustainable business for them. The MEs were essentially running a business, sub-contracting work to the WEs, who were paid according to the number of orders they completed and quality of work carried out on them.





# RESULTS

## RESPONSIVENESS RATE

The PnP project reached its conclusion in 2012. Many of the female MEs who were a part of the project had been in touch with KCF to seek business advice, help and orders. Nonetheless, the 'Crafting Connections' project connected with all 213 MEs to determine their current status. Out of 213 phone calls, **82 were connected** which forms a **responsiveness rate of 39%**. Other calls statuses were: *not connected, not picked, wrong number and phone off*. The call status of 213 women is represented in the table below.

CALL STATUS	NUMBER OF MEs	PERCENTAGE [%]
CALL CONNECTED	82	39
CALLS NOT CONNECTED	65	31
PHONE OFF	34	16
CALL NOT PICKED	17	8
WRONG NUMBER	12	6
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>213</b>	<b>100</b>

## MEs CURRENTLY REPORTING RUNNING A BUSINESS

The first question asked of the MEs was if they were currently running a business in embellishments. **55 out of 82 women** MEs reported that they were currently running a business in embellishments and/or related to the garments & textile sector. Hence, **67.07%** of the women with whom a connection was rekindled are currently running a business.

The women who were currently not employing their skills to run a business formed **32.93%** of the total connected women. These women were not running a business due to various reasons such as; better alternative opportunities, post-project familial opposition, sickness, could not continue after a life-changing event/experience (e.g. marriage, a parent's death etc.), mobility, could not maintain relationship with buyer/payment problems and some chose not to give a reason. The breakdown of responses is in the table below

REASONS	REPORTED NUMBER OF WOMEN
POST-PROJECT FAMILIAL OPPOSITION	2
SICKNESS	3
BETTER ALTERNATIVE OPPORTUNITIES	2
COULD NOT CONTINUE AFTER A LIFE-CHANGING EXPERIENCE	6
MOBILITY ISSUE	3
COULD NOT MAINTAIN RELATION WITH THE BUYERS	4
NO REPORTED DATA	7

The data collected on income and their businesses is hence based on a sample of **55 female Micro-Entrepreneurs**.



## AVERAGE NUMBER OF WORKERS EMPLOYED

One of the variables of interest was the scale of the business that MEs are currently operating in. One of the proxies for scale of the business is the number of workers employed. The workers are also the indirect beneficiaries of the business as they are employed and paid according to the orders they receive from the MEs. Most of the workers are women who were part of the MEDA programs, but a few MEs have also employed new workers closer to their area and some male workers as well. The project revealed that an **ME employs around 53 workers on average**. A detailed working is given in Appendix C.

## AVERAGE MONTHLY INCOME OF MES

The primary variable of interest is the economic improvement in the lives of the MEs after the program. The aim is to ascertain whether such a working model continues to be economically beneficial to the MEs even after three years of completion of the project. Questions were asked regarding the monthly profit (savings after all the business costs have been accounted for). The interviewer asked about the estimated number of products that the MEs sell and their estimated price. The breakdown of each cost incurred was also asked from each ME. This working of profit was verified with the estimated monthly income figure as told by the ME herself in order to ensure maximum consistency in response. Also, prudent figures were included in the entire analysis to avoid over-stating of results. The **average monthly income a ME is calculated to be Rs. 23,427 (GBP 157)**. A detailed working is presented in Appendix C.

## AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD MONTHLY INCOME

The purpose of acquiring an ME's household income was to ascertain the extent to which their household incomes have improved. The profession and income of each earning member of the household was asked and prudent estimates were accounted. **The average monthly household income of an ME is Rs. 42, 947 (GBP 289)**. Details of each ME's household income is given in Appendix C.

## PROPORTION OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME EARNED BY ME

The proportion of household income earned by the ME is a useful variable because it depicts the economic contribution of the woman in her household. KCF believes that her increased economic contribution in the household empowers her not only in the domestic space, but also in the social and political space and lends her influence over her own decisions & ones regarding her family. This variable was calculated by dividing the monthly income of each ME with her household income to derive her economic contribution in her household. The proportion is then converted in %. Appendix C highlights the economic contribution of each ME in her household. The **average proportion of household income earned by ME is 0.52 or 52%**. This depicts that the women MEs, on average, contribution more than half of the earnings earned in their household which is a significant contribution.





## APPENDIX A

### BRIEF RESULTS OF PNP PROJECT

- A significant increase of 135% in income was seen in the data results when compared with the baseline. This increase can be attributed to the successful, relevant and effective project activities; including exhibitions and buyer-seller meetings. During discussion with the project staff, it was found out that the boutique owners had increased the share of hand-made embroidery in their outlets, due to availability of good quality embellishment work and also due to increase in the prices of machine-made embroidery.
- An improvement in the quality of life in the targeted households was evident from the fact that the responding households were spending 36% of their incomes on food as compare to 42% during the baseline survey. Similarly due to increase in income, on average, 58% of the WE's assessed had started saving 6% of their income.
- About 76% or more were applying improved production practices and also, 98% of the respondents were satisfied with the improvement in production due to application of newly learnt skills.
- Women's participation in household decision making had significantly increased especially in saving (71% increase from the baseline), in food consumption and household expenditures (46% from the baseline), mobility outside home (45% from the baseline) and in getting health services (48% from the baseline). Similarly the participation in community and voting had also significantly increased. There was a marked increase in every indicator related to women household decision making.

## APPENDIX B

### TRAININGS IN PNP PROJECT

#### TRAININGS GIVEN TO MEs AND WEs

- | MICRO-ENTREPRENEURS                 | WOMEN EMBELLISHERS                                    |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| 1. LEADERSHIP & GROUP STRENGTHENING | 1. TEAMWORK & CONFLICT RESOLUTION                     |
| 2. TEAMWORK & CONFLICT RESOLUTION   | 2. PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT THROUGH SHARING OF NEW DESIGNS |
| 3. PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT              | 3. QUALITY CONTROL                                    |
| 4. PRICING & COSTING                | 4. COMMUNITY BASED SAVING GROUP                       |
| 5. INPUT SUPPLY PURCHASING          |   |
| 6. PRODUCTION PLANNING & MANAGEMENT |   |
| 7. QUALITY CONTROL                  |   |
| 8. MARKETING                        |   |



**DETAILED WORKING OF RESULTS**

Sr. No.	Names	District	House hold Members	Call Connected?	Currently running a business/ Micro-entrepreneurs	Current Profession	Number of workers employed	Personal Income (per month)	Current Household Income (including her income)	Proportion of income earned by women
1	Amtul Hafeez	Lahore	9	Yes	Yes	Sales Agent/ Micro Entrepreneur	15	15000	69000	0.2173913
2	Khatija Tul Qubra	Lahore	4	Yes	Yes	Contracted with manufacturers	20	5000	15000	0.3333333
3	Shazia Afzal	Lahore	5	Yes	Yes	Sales Agent for bridal/ Adda work	20	10000	30000	0.3333333
4	Muzmil Akber	Lahore	4	Yes	Yes	Embroidery work with a contractor named Moiz (Shobinak)	30	10000	10000	1
5	Hina Ahsan	Lahore	5	Yes	Yes	Working on machine embroidery	12	120000	155000	0.7741935
6	Shahnaz Bashir	Lahore	22	Yes	Yes	Crochet & Embroidery (herself)	0	5000	22000	0.2272727
7	Saira Hanif	Lahore	9	Yes	Yes	Gota	100	5000	20000	0.25
8	Fatima Batool	Lahore	8	Yes	Yes	Runs a boutique/ Has a stitching unit	30	15000	27000	0.5555556
9	Sajida Arshad	Lahore		Yes	Yes	Stitching	15	18000	18000	1
10	Almas Akram	Gujranwala	7	Yes	Yes	Adda Work	30	20000	40000	0.5
11	Sarha Shamim	Gujranwala		Yes	Yes	Embroidery	100	10000	30000	0.3333333
12	Magrat Shamoon	Gujranwala	7	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	15	5000	25000	0.2
13	Zobia Khalid	Gujranwala	5	Yes	Yes	Stitching	25	3000	16000	0.1875
14	Asia Yaseen	Gujranwala	6	Yes	Yes	Makes Uppers	60	30000	48000	0.625
15	Suriya Sharif	Kasur	3	Yes	Yes	Adda/embroidery	150	60000	60000	1
16	Fouzia Rasheed	Kasur	7	Yes	Yes	Adda	30	28000	28000	1
17	Fahmida Afzal	Kasur	2	Yes	Yes	Adda	30	5000	16000	0.3125
18	Muqadas Manzoor	Kasur	6	Yes	Yes	Stitcher	8	30000	60000	0.5
19	Irshad Yousaf	Kasur	6	Yes	Yes	Adda/Boutique	2	12000	12000	1
20	Nusrat parveen	Sheikhupura	11	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	100	10000	70000	0.1428571
21	Kausar Arshad	Sheikhupura	6	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	20	10000	30000	0.3333333
22	Shabana Kanwal	Sheikhupura	5	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	35	20000	22000	0.9090909
23	Shagufta Saleem	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	All Embroideries related to Handicrafts	50	15000	55000	0.2727273
24	Abida Ashraf	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	Tarkashi & Embroidery	100	15000	45000	0.3333333
25	Rabia	Bhawalpur	10	Yes	Yes	Embroidery/gota	30	30000	40000	0.75



## APPENDIX C

26	Kaniz Fatima	Bhawalpur	7	Yes	Yes	Does work for households	0	3000	23000	0.1304348
27	Nusrat Mushtaq	Bhawalpur	10	Yes	Yes	Embroidery/Gota	40	9000	47000	0.1914894
28	Shazia Shaheen	Bhawalpur	8	Yes	Yes	Sets for dowry	12	3000	16000	0.1875
29	Irshad bibi	Bhawalpur	10	Yes	Yes	Mukaish	50	100000	100000	1
30	Azeezan khatoon	Bhawalpur	11	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	35	1000	4100	0.2439024
31	Abida Batool	Bhawalpur	5	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	50	6000	13000	0.4615385
32	Shazia Shawaiz	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	Does work for household	100	57000	87000	0.6551724
33	Bakht Bibi	Raheem Yar Khan	8	Yes	Yes	Embroideries	50	5000	25000	0.2
34	Farkhan da Malik	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	200	25000	65000	0.3846154
35	Salma Kashif	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	Gota/Mukaish	15	5000	15000	0.3333333
36	Anser Nazir	Bhawalpur	6	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	25	5000	25000	0.2
37	Asma Sanaullah	Bhawalpur	2	Yes	Yes	Stitching	0	5000	5000	1
38	Razia Asif	Bhawalpur	3	Yes	Yes	Karhai/Mukaish/Gota	50	40000	40000	1
39	Shazia Tabassum	Bhawalpur	7	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	20	1000	21000	0.047619
40	Kaneezan Mayee	Lodhran	3	Yes	Yes	Embroidery	15	6000	46000	0.1304348
41	Balqes Akbar	Lodhran	19	Yes	Yes	Taarkashi	20	15500	60000	0.2583333
42	Salma Asghar	Lodhran	25	Yes	Yes	Nakshi	0	15000	100000	0.15
43	Afrazia Bibi	Haripur	6	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	200	20000	36000	0.5555556
44	Syeda Abida Bibi	Haripur	9	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	100	80000	110000	0.7272727
45	Sayian Bibi	Haripur	5	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	80	25000	65000	0.3846154
46	Nazakat Wali	Abbotabad	4	Yes	Yes	Crotette bedsheets	50	4000	4000	1
47	Shaista Zulifqar	Hari Pur	4	Yes	Yes	Handicrafts/Jisty	0	70000	75000	0.9333333
48	Noushaba Noshad	Haripur	5	Yes	Yes	Boutique	500	25000	50000	0.5
49	Tasleem Rashid	Haripur	5	Yes	Yes	Khaddi	25	50000	50000	1
50	Shahbna m Awan	Abbotabad	5	Yes	Yes	jisty and phulkari	15	25000	70000	0.3571429
51	Tehmina Faheem	Abbotabad	5	Yes	Yes	Embroidery/boutique	20	25000	40000	0.625
52	Lubna Tariq	Haripur	5	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	13	45000	45000	1
53	Mansha Khatoon	Haripur	10	Yes	Yes	Jisti	20	17000	27000	0.6296296
54	Nasfeesa	Haripur	7	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	15	20000	35000	0.5714286
55	Fahmida	Haripur	5	Yes	Yes	Khaddar	150	75000	100000	0.75

**AVERAGES** 7.094339623

53

23427.27273

42947.2727

0.5218019

